

THE TRANSPERSONAL MOVEMENT:
A RUSSIAN PERSPECTIVE ON ITS EMERGENCE
AND PROSPECTS FOR FURTHER DEVELOPMENT*

V. V. Nalimov
Moscow, Russia

Jeanna A. Drogalina
Moscow, Russia

According to Dostoevsky, religion is a sort of therapy. It helps people to remove inner tension in situations when reality cannot be changed (Yu. G. Kudryavtsev, 1991).

A NEW VISION OF HUMAN NATURE

This is the report of a computerized scientometric study of *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology* for the years beginning with its first issue in 1969 and extending through 1989. We interpret the results of the analysis in terms of the evolving development and vision of the transpersonal movement, and from observations about the movement from a Russian perspective.

Describing the process of the *Journal's* emergence, its editor commented in 1990 as follows:

Clearly, none of us had reached perfection, and our personal idiosyncrasies were still quite apparent. But we were gradually becoming aware, individually and as a group, that a

"We wish to thank our colleagues Dr. V. D. Myatlev (computer programming) and T. N. Lyubimova and T. I. Murashova (computer data processing). The work was sponsored by the Center of Complex Human Studies at the Institute of Philosophy of the USSR Academy of Sciences.

This paper is a modified version of one published in Russian by V. V. Nalimov and J. A. Drogalina, (1993). *Transpersonalnoye vizheniye: Istoriyal perspective [Transpersonal movement: History and perspective]*, pp. 116-129. In V. V. Nalimov, *Quest for other meanings*. Moscow: Progress.

Part of pages 51 and 52 will appear as a chapter in a forthcoming book, *Everything is according to the way: Voices of Russian transpersonalism*. T. R. Soidla & S. I. Shapiro (Eds.) (1996). Brisbane: Bolda-Lok, in press.

The present study was translated into English by A. Yarkov.

Copyright © 1996 Transpersonal Institute

psychology focused primarily on the self or the actualizing person neglected a larger context. About this time one of our editors reformulated a Zen aphorism, and in retrospect it expresses much of what we had learned:

To study psychology is to study the self.
To study the self is to forget the self.
To forget the self is to be enlightened by all things.

As our interest expanded to include a more-than-personal orientation, we saw that, as an expansion of psychology, such a perspective needed its own identity, its own voice and structures, to support the different attitudes and values that were *associated* with it. This is what led us to conceptualize a transpersonal orientation, one that extended across, through, and beyond personal psychological boundaries. It also led Anthony Sutich and Abraham Maslow, and others in our working group, to create *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology* in 1969, eight years after they had begun the *Journal of Humanistic Psychology*. The new journal was well received from the start, and a membership group, the Association for Transpersonal Psychology, was soon formed. Today the *Journal* and Association are supported by about 4,000 subscribers and members (Vich, 1990, p. 48).

Further, Vich outlines the position that the *Journal* occupies in the contemporary world:

Given this brief retrospective, I want to suggest that much work is yet to be done. Our entire culture is going through wave after wave of change, and interest in transpersonal topics is growing rapidly. Psychologists have an especially important role in understanding and interpreting these changes. They need to pay attention to transpersonal factors in psychotherapy, education and training, organizational behavior, social attitudes and values, cultural conflicts, and in a broader sense, the fate of humanity in a world at risk. Psychologists who are experienced in and who understand the basic nature of transpersonal practices and ideas have a special contribution to make to their students, clients, friends, and colleagues (p. 49).

Transpersonal psychology challenged not only traditional, positivist-flavored psychology but also science when it is oriented toward the mechanistic vision of the world. The struggle is still going on. Currently the transpersonal vision of human nature is somewhat on the side of the main road of academic science. However, it is becoming more widely recognized, as is obvious from the fact that the new journal is indexed in eight indices:

Oncore! Health Science Indexes,
International Bibliography of Periodical Literature,
International Bibliography of Book Reviews,
Mental Health Abstracts,
Psychological Reader's Guide.

Also, starting with 1982:

Current Contents/Social & Behavioral Science,
Social Science Citation Index,
Contenta Religionum.

The above list shows that transpersonal psychology is also beginning to acquire a transdisciplinary nature.

Ideas and methods of transpersonal psychology are regularly discussed at international conferences. We shall indicate here only those in which we personally participated.

In the fall of 1988 in Santa Rosa, California, the Tenth International Conference on transpersonal psychology was held for ten days. In the fall of 1990 the Second European Conference on transpersonal psychology took place in Strasbourg, France. It should be emphasized that the transpersonal movement is in no way isolated. It evolves in a broad field of a contemporary spiritual search for a nonideological-bound world.

In spring 1988 in Hanover, Germany, the International Congress "Man and Nature" was held with an audience of 2,000. Among those who took the floor were philosophers, theologians, scholars, and representatives of the arts. The task of the Congress was to reveal the entire spiritual and intellectual wealth of our planet. Every day the work would start at 7:00 in the morning with meditation sessions carried out in different Eastern and Western traditions. This, on one hand, brought the Congress closer to transpersonal psychology and, on the other hand, bewildered and even irritated the local press.

The title of the international symposium that took place in spring, 1990, in Chanon, France, is also noteworthy: "Man and Planetary Consciousness: Human Freedom and Boundaries." Finally, we can mention a "counter" example: also in spring, 1990, in San Francisco the international conference "Consciousness in Science" was held, organized by the American division of the Bhaktivedanta Institute based in Bombay. At that event, Oriental thought was to meet the paradigm of Western science. Indeed, during the Conference's first two days, rigorous positivism prevailed and was overcome only some time later.

IS RUSSIA PREPARED TO PARTICIPATE IN THE SEARCH FOR A NEW VISION OF HUMANITY?

The answer to the query proposed in the above title can surely be positive. The search for free, nonconfessional spirituality started in Russia as long ago as the eighteenth century, and was related then to the emergence of Freemasonry. In 1788, a Russian translation of the *Bhagavad-gita* was published in Moscow (Smimov, 1960). Later, free spiritual quest proceeded in several directions. In the nineteenth century, Dostoevsky occupied a significant place. He was not only the greatest Russian writer but also an outstanding philosopher of the Christian idea permeating everyday life. Then came Lev Tolstoy, with his attempts to embody the Christian idea into life in an honest manner, without compromise; he subjected the social hypocrisy of the Orthodox Church to sharp criticism. At the end of the nineteenth century, Orthodox Christianity became somewhat less rigid. Original, Christian-oriented philosophers appeared. V. Solovyov formulated the conception of positive universal unity ("the true unity not counteropposing to multiplicity"), the teaching of the soul and its Sophia element, of human God-likeness opening up the road to salvation. P. Florensky (the orthodox theologian with a mathematical background, also known for his work on art and technical physics) continued to elaborate the concept of Sophia.

S. Bulgakov, a theologian and philosopher (a "legal Marxist" in his youth) was very important for his views on cosmic topics and also the Sophia element; he perceived nature as a living creature.

The notion of Sophia comes from ancient Greece and represents a teaching of semantic saturation and arrangement of things. In Bulgakov's writings, divine Sophia acquires an image of eternal virginity; the world proves to be Sophia in the making; he regards each person as both individual and all-humanity (Zin'kovsky, 1989).

In its Russian interpretation, the teaching of Sophia and all-humanity has something in common with the outlook of transpersonal psychology, although this school of psychology seems to more frequently reflect a Buddhist worldview rather than a Christian one.

Such well-known names of occult figures in the West as N. Roerich, G. Gurdjieff, and P. Ouspensky are also linked to Russian roots. The internationally known philosopher, N. Berdyaev (who also began as a "legal Marxist"), also belongs to Russia.

The range of religious and philosophical thinking in the former Russia was astonishingly broad. The intellectuals, not satisfied with either traditional classic philosophy, or Marxism, or scientism (then in its formative stage), or the Orthodox Christian Church frozen in the past, were involved in a constant quest. As to common people, all kinds of sects! developed in their midst, although severely suppressed.

In the 1920s, the spiritual quest went on. Interest was displayed in such trends of thought as theosophy, anthroposophy, the teachings of ancient Oriental cultures, and Western esotericism rooted in gnosticism. Books by Yu, Nikolaev (1913), E. Schure (1977), W. James (1902), and R. Bucke (1923) were very popular.

In some circles, an attempt was made to construct a transcultural outlook based on the entire variety of past spiritual experiences (traditions) without its being opposed to modern science. The past was thus interpreted within the culture of the present. But in the 1930s, totalitarianism began to exterminate all dissidence.

In our day, when ideological pressure has so thoroughly decreased, there is new hope for spiritual resurrection. It is natural, on the one hand, to reevaluate the past, and, on the other hand, to also comprehend the contemporary quest for spirituality in the West. Hence the interest in our country today in the transpersonal movement.

Our task in Russia seems to be not to join the transpersonal movement thoughtlessly but to form a complementary trend of thought. This is similar to the formation of the conception developed by V.V. Nalimov. It is close to the ideas developed by transpersonal psychologists but does not completely coincide with them. We can say that they complement each other.

What is common to the two approaches includes: rejection of reductionism in describing the nature of consciousness; recognition of the transpersonal nature of personality and its being open to cosmic principles; awareness of the part played by meditation- both as a means of studying human consciousness and as a therapeutic

tool; and interest in manifestations of altered states of consciousness no matter what their origin.

What is different is the form of theoretical construction. In contrast to most perspectives in transpersonal psychology, Nalimov 1) constructs a distinctly deductive (axiomatized) model of personality using the language of mathematical concepts; 2) makes comparison to certain notions of theoretical physics; 3) proceeds, on one hand, from initial concepts of Plato and their further evolution in Western philosophy, and on the other, from a Christian world outlook more than from Buddhist philosophy. In accordance with this, the central idea of Nalimov's conception is the teaching of meaning as an organizing principle of human nature.'

SCIENTOMETRIC ANALYSIS OF *THE JOURNAL OF TRANSPERSONAL PSYCHOLOGY*

We have carried out the analysis of *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology* beginning with its emergence in 1969 up to 1989 inclusive. "The total number of papers published during this period is 222 (we shall call them "sources"). Twenty-five percent of them did not have any reference lists. The rest collectively contained 5,446 references.

Chief Authors of the Source Articles

In twenty-one years, a total of 156 authors' published their papers in the *Journal*, the most active among them (five or more papers) being:

Chinen, A.	S	Tart, C.	5
Epstein, M.	5	Walsh, R.	8
Goleman, D.	7	Welwood, J.	11
Lukoff, D.	6	Wilber, K.	6
Ram Dass/Alpert	7		

The authors of the first issue of the *Journal* were: T. Armor, R. Assagioli, A.H. Maslow (two papers), A. Mavens, M.H. Murphy, and A.J. Sutich. The paper by Maslow from this issue, entitled "Various Meanings of Transcendence," is still well-known in our day.

Note that the authors of *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology* frequently cite the authors of the papers published in the same issue. The total number of the citations is 352. The most cited (five or more times) among them are the following authors:

Welwood, J.	39*	Sutich, A.	16	Lukoff, D.	10
Goleman, D.	33	Tart, C.	16	Epstein, M.	7
Walsh, R.	25	Grof, S.	15	Chinen, A.	5
Wilber, K.	23	Maslow, A.	11	Weide, T.	5

*The number of citations, including self-citation.

Actually, each author in the list is well known in transpersonal psychology by his contribution to its development, and seven authors are cited fifteen to forty times.

Key Words of Source Papers

Key words from the titles of source papers were isolated. The list of these words was supplemented by semantically charged key words borrowed from the texts of the papers. The following words, listed by frequency of occurrence, proved to be most significant:

transpersonal	47	states	14	practice	5
meditation	40	Buddhist	13	rational	5
psychology	39	self	10	transcendence	5
therapy	37	death	8	biofeedback	4
consciousness	21	mind	7	LSD	4
experience	21	human	6	psychiatric	4
spiritual	14	physicists	5	shamanism	4

The most frequently occurring word is, naturally, the word "transpersonal," then words with very similar frequencies were "meditation," "psychology," and "therapy." We may conclude that these four most frequently occurring words collectively help outline the content of the new discipline. The frequency of the occurrence of the words "consciousness" and "experience" was equal but lower than the four basic key words. The word "Buddhist" is also very significant for the transpersonal trend of thought. At the same time the word "Christian" is of a much lesser frequency, occurring only twice in the titles of source papers. The word "philosophy" occurs only once. Among Western philosophers only J.P. Sartre is mentioned and only once.

Journals Cited in Source Papers in The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology

During the first twenty-one years of its existence, 364 other journals and 49 collections of papers were cited in the *Journal*. Sources in the references (i.e., the basic sources for the *Journal*) are identified as "journals" if there are indications of periodicity, such as year, volume, issue. If the editor and place of edition are given, the source is identified as a "collection of papers." Note that although the classification is sufficiently conventional, it does not distort the general picture.

The total number of papers in the journals and collections of papers was 2,549.⁶

All the sources identified as journal were ranked by the number of references to them. The alphabetized list below enumerates the journals referred to at least five times (the right-hand column is the number of references).

<i>American J. of Psychiatry</i>	44	<i>EEG and Clinical Neurophysiology</i>	37
<i>American J. of Psychotherapy</i>	19	<i>Hospital and Community Psychiatry</i>	5
<i>American Psychologist</i>	13	<i>Human Development</i>	10
<i>Annals of the N.Y. Academy of Sciences</i>	21	<i>Indian J. of Medical Research</i>	9
<i>Archives of General Psychiatry</i>	49	<i>Indian Psychology</i>	10
<i>British J. of Psychiatry</i>	9	<i>International J. of Clinical and Experimental Hypnosis</i>	24
<i>Biofeedback and Self-Regulation</i>	8	<i>International J. of Psychoanalysis</i>	30
<i>Crystal Mirror</i>	9	<i>International J. of Parapsychology</i>	11
<i>Dissertation Abstracts International</i>	18	<i>J. of Abnormal Psychology</i>	19

<i>J. of Altered States of Consciousness</i>	6	<i>Perspectives in Biological Medicine</i>	8
<i>J. of the American Psychoanalytic Association</i>	22	<i>Philosophical Quarterly</i>	11
<i>J. of the American Society for Or</i>		<i>Psyche</i>	8
<i>Psychical Research</i>	11	<i>Psychedelic Review</i>	9
<i>J. of Clinical Psychology</i>	12	<i>Psychiatry</i>	20
<i>J. of Consulting and Clinical Psychology</i>	20	<i>Psychoanalytical Review</i>	21
<i>J. of Consulting Psychology</i>	10	<i>Psychoanalysis and Contemporary Thought</i>	6
<i>J. of Counseling Psychology</i>	15	<i>Psychological Review</i>	13
<i>J. of Humanistic Psychology</i>	62	<i>Psychologia</i>	61
<i>J. of Nervous and Mental Diseases</i>	32	<i>Psychological Bulletin</i>	9
<i>J. of Projective Techniques and Personality Assessment</i>	8	<i>Psychological Reports</i>	17
<i>J. of Religion and Health</i>	7	<i>Psychology Today</i>	14
<i>J. for the Scientific Study of Religion</i>	13	<i>Psychophysiology</i>	11
<i>J. for the Study of Consciousness</i>	6	<i>Psychosomatic Medicine</i>	22
<i>J. of Transpersonal Psychology</i>	352	<i>ReVision</i>	31
<i>Main Currents in Modern Thought</i>	12	<i>Res. J. of Philosophy and Social Sciences</i>	10
<i>Perceptual and Motor Skills</i>	16	<i>Schizophrenia Bulletin</i>	9
		<i>Science</i>	23
		<i>Scientific American</i>	9
<hr/>			
<i>Studies in Comparative Religion</i>	2	<i>Zygon: The Journal of Religion and Science</i>	3
<i>The American Theosophist</i>	2	<i>Physics Today</i>	1
<i>Transcultural Psychiatric Research Review</i>	4		

The five journals under the line should not, as a matter of fact, belong to the list, as they occur less than five times. However, they are listed to emphasize that the authors of the transpersonal approach do not yet pay sufficient attention to the trends represented by these journals. That they appear at all is a noteworthy indication of surpassing the boundaries of purely psychological problems, thus attaching to the transpersonal approach an interdisciplinary flavor, a trend that may continue.

In the most recent six years in this study, the range of the journals cited narrowed. The remaining journals had the following frequencies of occurrence:

Psychology		Psychiatry	
<i>American Psychologist</i>	6	<i>International J. of Clinical and Experimental Hypnosis</i>	5
<i>J. of Clinical Psychology</i>	7	<i>Psychoanalysis and Contemporary Thought</i>	6
<i>J. of Consulting Psychology</i>	7		6
<i>J. of Abnormal Psychology</i>	8	<i>Schizophrenia</i>	8
<i>J. of Humanistic Psychology</i>	9	<i>Psychotherapy</i>	10
<i>Human Development</i>	10	<i>J. of the American Society for Psychical Research</i>	11
<i>J. of Transpersonal Psychology</i>	152	<i>J. of the American Psychoanalytic Association</i>	16
Medicine		<i>Archives of General Psychiatry</i>	20
<i>J. of Nervous and Mental Diseases</i>	7	<i>American J. of Psychiatry</i>	22
Interdisciplinary approach		<i>International J. of Psychoanalysis</i>	22
<i>J. for the Scientific Study of Religion</i>	7		
<i>ReVision</i>	14		

In the Psychology section, the greatest contribution comes from *The Journal Of Transpersonal Psychology* because of self-citation.

Psychiatry includes general psychiatry, and psychoanalysis, as well as psychotherapy. The latter seems to provoke the interest towards shamanism (two collections of papers). This subject is certainly related to the problems of consciousness as well.

The category of interdisciplinary approach includes *Rei/ision: The Journal of Consciousness and Change*. Here, again, we have a collection of papers related to the problems of consciousness as well as the comparison of Eastern and Western psychological paths.

The number of references changes over five-year periods. In the most recent six years, it increased substantially, while the number of journals decreased. Out of fifty-six titles only twenty journals and seven collections of papers remained. Such a reduction of topics may indicate that in the process of development, the transpersonal trend has concentrated its subject with an emphasis on therapy. This conjecture is also supported by the key words in the publications cited, where "therapy," "experience," and "consciousness," as well as "meditation" and "psychology," have the greatest weight.

Also, in the list we found journals which were cited through all the time periods. They are journals on psychiatry, hypnosis, and psychology, and among these, the *Journal of Humanistic Psychology* and *The Journal Of Transpersonal Psychology* have a very high rate of citation.

It is of interest also to examine the distribution of journals with respect to their specialization (though it cannot be always done unambiguously). In the following classification of the journals listed above, the first figure denotes the number of references, the second, the number of journals:

Hypnosis	24	1	humanistic	62	1
Medicine	97	5	clinical & consulting	57	4
including: general	28	3	general	169	10
neurophysiology	37	1	transpersonal	352	1
neurology	32	1	Psychotherapy	60	6
Interdisciplinary journals	39	1	Psychophysiology and		
General scientific journals	71	4	psychosomatics	33	2
Parapsychology	11	1	Religion	20	2
Psychiatry	122	4	Consciousness: altered		
Psychoanalysis	79	4	states of consciousness	6	1
Psychology: anomalous	19	1	study of consciousness	6	1
Orrenml	9	1	Philosophy	33	3

We would like to emphasize the following observations:

1) *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology* is cited approximately twice as often as journals of general psychology.

2) Journals of general and psychoanalytic psychiatry have a high citation rate.

3) A high citation rate also occurred for medical journals including neurology and neurophysiology. This indicates the links between the new transpersonal trend and the classical methods of science in studying higher nervous activity, and underlines not only the idea of succession but also the interdisciplinary nature of the new approach.

4) We would also like to emphasize parallels to the development of humanistic psychology, from which *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology* is distinguished.

5) We are intrigued by the apparent remoteness from the field of philosophy. It would be fair to note, however, that in the depths of the transpersonal trend, a new philosophy may be emerging based on the experience of researchers with various states of consciousness.

Citations of Monographs

In this study of the *Journal*, 1,320 books were found to be cited during twenty-one years. A.H. Maslow (1908-1970), one of the founders of the transpersonal movement, has three books counted among those highly cited, the total number of their citations being fifty-three:

The Farther Reaches of Human Nature, 1971 = 15;
Toward a Psychology of Being, 1962/1968/1969 (all editions) = 24;
Religions, Values, and Peak-Experiences, 1970 = 14.

W. James (1842-1910), who wrote convincingly of the reality and psychological significance of religious experience, is cited thirty-nine times:

The Varieties of Religious Experience, 1902/1929/1958/1963 = 28
The Principles of Psychology, 1980 = 11

Also, R. Assagioli (1888-1974), the founder of the trend called psychosynthesis, published *Psychosynthesis*, 1965/1971/1976, which was cited twenty-five times; S. Grof, *Realms of the Human Unconscious: Observation from LSD Research*, 1975/1976 = 22; P. Kapleau, *The Three Pillars of Zen*, 1965/1966/1967/1980 = 22; K. Wilber's books are cited forty-nine times, the most frequent being *The Atman Project: A Transpersonal View of Human Development*, 1980 = 12 and *The Spectrum of Consciousness*, 1977 = 16.

Note that the list of cited books by e.G. Jung contains forty-seven different titles with a total citation frequency of eighty-seven. Each of his books though, is usually cited only once or twice, with two cited more often namely:

Psychology and Religion, 1958 = 7
Memories, Dreams, Reflections, 1961/1965/1966 = 6

Key Words in Cited Publications (Journals, Books, Collections of Papers)

The titles of the printed matter cited in the *Journal* over twenty-one years use the following words most frequently (figures denote the frequency):

Buddhism,-istic,-a	201	mysticism	194	therapy	338
consciousness	375	practice	103	transcendence	115
experience	345	psychology,-ist	475	transpersonal	116
human	150	Self	202	yoga	175
meditation	565	shamanism	77	Zen	217
mind	146	states	228		

If this list is compared to key words occurring in the source papers (p. 54), the word "transpersonal" is no longer dominant and there is a higher frequency of "meditation," "psychology," "consciousness," "experience;" "therapy"-which is almost identical to the group of key words identified in the source papers.

These five words outline the branches of knowledge and fields of activities from which the transpersonal movement has primarily proceeded. Note again the high frequency of the word "Buddhist," while "Christian" occurs much less often. The list of significant key words includes "yoga," "Zen," and "shamanism," testifying to the interest towards therapeutic practices preserved in the traditions of other cultures. Here an interdisciplinary approach is also apparent.

Comparison of the List of Authors Cited in The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology with the List of Scholars Entering the Dictionary Psikhologiya

We also compared the authors in the Russian dictionary *Psikhologiya* [Psychology] (petrovsky & Yaroshevsky, 1990), which formed the foundation of Russian psychological science, with the authors referred to by the transpersonal movement in *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology*.

The significance of the latter is estimated by total citation rate, and that of the former by the linear measurement of the dictionary entry. These two rank estimates seem to be comparable, since in both cases the length of a text is estimated, though for the *Journal* it is reduced to the number of citations.

Only 13 names out of 139 occur as both a reference in the *Journal* and an entry in the Russian dictionary *Psikhologiya* (the figures denote total citation rate):

Maslow,A.	95	Piaget,J.	6	Han,G.	1
Jung, C.	87	Rogers,C.	6	Selye,H.	1
Freud,S.	59	Darwin,C.	2	Skinner,B.	1
James, W.	52	Horney,K.	2	Spencer,G.	1
Frankl,V.	8				

It should be noted that the dictionary *Psikhologiya* contains the names of authors who gained a foothold in such areas of the past paradigm as psychology, psychiatry, pedagogy, neurophysiology, and, partially, classical philosophy. The transpersonal

movement that has emerged as a response to the problems related to the contemporary state of mental and spiritual health is outside the paradigm. Hence it follows that the paradigm lags behind the urgent contemporary tasks. If out of 139 scholars mentioned in the dictionary only thirteen are cited in *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology*, that means there is only 10.07% overlap with the scientific foundation of Russian academic psychology. Another approach to the evaluation of overlapping is possible: to compare the total length of the text allotted to all the names in the dictionary and the length of the text related to the authors cited in *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology*. The overlapping is still only 12.08%, and therefore, both procedures yield similar results.

That the paradigm is lagging behind contemporary psychological problems is also testified to by the item in the dictionary devoted to A. Maslow, which does not contain the information that as one of the founders of transpersonal psychology he developed a new concept of human nature.

External Citation of the Authors from The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology

We would have liked to conclude this paper by demonstrating the citation of all the authors of the *Journal* under study during the entire period of its existence. But this task could not be fulfilled since we did not yet have a computerized version of citation indices, and an analysis could not be accurately accomplished manually. Therefore we limited ourselves to a partial study which, nevertheless, allows us to obtain certain characteristics of the new trend.

We selected the most active authors who published their papers in the *Journal* not less than five times. Their citation rate was estimated by means of data provided by the Institute for Scientific Information (ISI) in two editions: *The Science Citation Index* and *The Social Science Citation Index*.

The most cited author is D. Goleman (N = 49), whom we noted earlier was both one of the most active authors of *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology* and the most cited author of the same journal, followed by R. Walsh = 26, C. Tart = 17, J. Welwood = 15, K. Wilber = 10, S. Grof = 9, A. Sutich = 9, A. Maslow = 5. R. Assagioli has no external citation.

The data confirmed the conclusion that the new trend of transpersonal psychology has not become part of the mainstream paradigm. The latter resists, which indicates that the growing trend is not merely new but in a sense contrary to the existing paradigm.

Also note that the key words of the transpersonal trend started to include such words as "experience" and "therapy," i.e., concepts related to practical application of the ideas.

This signifies a form of recognition, and for this reason it is of interest to trace the dynamics of external citation. If it increases, the transpersonal trend develops. Below is a list of all authors in *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology*, 1984, volume 16

and their external citation rate. This year was selected as the starting point for a five-year period, since such a period is taken as a unit for cumulative editions of the ISI publications previously cited. Also, this is a period sufficient for citations in press to have appeared.

For external citation of authors who published their papers in *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology* in 1984, volume 16, the data are based on *The Science Citation Index* (1985-1989) (first column) and *The Social Science Citation Index* (1985-1989) (second column):

Komite, n.R.	none	none
Engler, J.	none	none
Welwood, J.	none	I - (self.citation)
Wilber, K. p. 75	none	1. <i>Psychotherapy</i> - 1* 2. <i>Philosophy and Social Criticism</i> - 1
Wilber, K. p. 137	none	1. <i>Psychotherapy</i> - 1 2. <i>Journal of Counseling and Development</i> - 1 3. <i>Psychological Reports</i> - 1
Asante, MK	none	none
Epstein, M.D.	none	none
Gross, R.	none	none
Shafranske, E.P.	none	1. <i>Journal of Humanistic Psychology</i> >1 2. <i>Professional Psychology</i> - 1
Armstrong, T.	none	none

"The title of the journal where the given author is cited, and the number of citations.

Note again that the table above indicates only the first authors (without their ranking according to the contribution into the trend development). Also, in the third five-year period of the *Journal's* existence, the external citation belongs not to the entire group but to specific authors constituting about twenty percent of the total list. These authors are Wilber, entering the group of the most active authors of the transpersonal movement, and Shafranske who does not enter any of the above identified groups.

Once again the conclusion is supported that the transpersonal movement has not yet acquired recognition, although a group of authors has formed having a common response. Actually these are authors, founders of schools, and carriers of ideas.

CONCLUSION

1. The transpersonal movement seems to be a trend with at least three noteworthy characteristics; 1) it has a demonstrated outlook; 2) it emphasizes therapeutics; 3) it accepts the scientific approach. There is also a professional participating group in its activities.

2. The specific feature of the new trend is its open recognition of the transpersonal principle in humans and their nonrational nature. These premises determine the peculiarities of related new therapies.

3. The new trend is not controlled by any doctrine. It is this circumstance that allowed it to enlist the participation of many gifted researchers.

4. The transpersonal movement seems to be the first trend in psychology which strives to truly become an interdisciplinary branch of human knowledge. It proceeds from different trends of psychology and psychiatry; neurophysiology and neurology; anthropology; Oriental studies; religious studies and mystical experience, including shamanism, Buddhism and Zen Buddhism: there is also an as yet weak connection to both philosophy and contemporary physics. Thus, through the transpersonal movement, a road to a complex study of human nature has been opened.

5. The difference from traditional psychological trends enables us to now speak about new growth evolving in the future of our culture.

6. We hope that in the future the boundaries of the transpersonal approach will be substantially expanded to link up with Western philosophy (of the past and present); contemporary science, primarily mathematics and theoretical physics, and perhaps even cosmogony. If we wish to approach the solution of the notorious problem of consciousness-matter, we shall have to find a language to describe both the semantic world and that of physical phenomena. The evolution of physics has long been going the way of geometrization of its concepts (Kalinowski, 1988). Hence it is natural to turn to geometrization of semantic concepts (Nalimov, 1989a) and, therefore, to mathematics (Nalimov, 1989b) and theoretical physics.

7. The above analysis is of interest from the scientometric position as well. This is illustrated by the present study which demonstrates the usefulness of a quantitative evaluation of the process of emergence and development of a new scientific discipline, one that has unfolded before our very eyes.

NOTES

(Sectarianism was a specific self-therapy of society. The diversity of sects was astonishing. On the one hand, there was, for example, a sect of *khlysty*, incorporating the ritual of collective sex (perhaps coming from Tantrism); on the other hand, in the sect of *scaptsy*, self-castration was the result of a specific reinterpretation of the New Testament. To be able to evaluate the diversity of sectarianism, it seems relevant to tell the reader about a preacher who belonged to the *Molokan* sect. He was well aware of the polymorphous nature of Biblical language: interpreting any Biblical phrase, he could use all its polysemantic treasures. During the Gulag Odyssey, intellectual had a chance to meet sectarians closely. They had amazing staunchness and self-command, and adherence to specific moral principles. But it was no less amazing to see! felt sharp IQ of science.

We would also like to mention that, in the institutional monasteries, the teaching of hesychasm (the Greek word denoting "peace," "silence," "renunciation") was smoldering, coming from Nil Sorsky and even earlier, through Byzantium, from Egyptian and Sinai ascetics. The "Jesus prayer" practiced in hesychasm was a form of meditation.

The study of meditation in our country is presented in detail in Nalimov (1982) (chapters devoted to this subject were written together with J. A. Drogalina). This book was not published in Russian until 1995 as publication was forbidden in our country. A review of the book can be found in *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology* (Grof 1982).

3 Nalimov's concept was best expressed in a book in Russian (Nalimov, 1989a). An English summary can be found in the paper by Drogalina (1990) published in a journal close to the transpersonal movement as well as in an article by Nalimov (1989b) in a journal dedicated to the philosophy of mathematics.

"There are computer-generated lists of: 1) all papers published in *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology*, 2) all papers cited in the source articles, both lists in alphabetical order. Each reference article in the list both facilitates bibliographic search and gives an idea of the article's contribution to the information flow, because the number of references indicated is its citation index.

5 What we mean is the name of the first author (according to scientometric standards).

6 The total number of references was 5,446, since not only journals and collections of papers were cited but also books, newspapers, reports, and theses, as well as proceedings of conferences and symposia. Some part of these sources, other than books, might have been referred to as journals if they had periodicity indications.

REFERENCES

- BUCKLE, R.M. (1923). *Cosmic consciousness: A study of the evolution of the human mind*. New York: Dutton.
- DROGALINA, Zh.A. (1990). Nalimov's conception of human nature. *ReVision: The Journal of Consciousness and Change*, 12(3), 19-29.
- GROF, S. (1982). [Review of book] *Realms of the unconscious: The enchanted frontier*, V.V. Nalimov. *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology*, 14(2), 186-188.
- JAMBS, W. (1902). *The varieties of religious experience*. London: Longman and Co.
- KALINOWSKI, M.W. (1988). The program of geometrization of physics: Some philosophical remarks. *Synthese: An International Journal for Epistemology, Methodology and Philosophy of Science*, 77(2), 129-138.
- KUORYAVTSEV, G. (1991). *Three circles of Dostoevsky*. [Published unknown].
- NALIMOV, V.V. (1982). *Realms of the unconscious: The enchanted frontier*. Philadelphia, PA: ISI Press.
- NALIMOV, V.V. (1989a). *Spontannos: soznaniya* [Spontaneity of consciousness: Probabilistic theory of meanings and semantic architectonics of personality]. Moscow: Prometheus.
- NALIMOV, V.V. (1989b). Can philosophy be mathematized? Probabilistic theory of meanings and semantic architectonics of personality. *Philosophia Matematica: An International Journal for the Philosophy of Modern Mathematics*. Second series, 4(2), 129-146.
- NIKOLAIV, Yu. (1913). *Vpoiskakh za boshestvom* [In search of deity: Essays on the history of gnosticism]. St. Petersburg: Novoye Vremya.
- PETROVSKAYA, V. & YAROSHEVSKY, M.G. (Eds.). (1990). *Psikhologiya* [Psychology], a dictionary. Moscow: Politicheskaya Literatura.
- SCHURER, (1977). *The great initiates*. New York: Blauvelt, Steinerbooks.
- SMIRNOV, R.L. (1960). Introduction to the *Mahabharata, II - Bhagavad-gita*. (In Russian) Ashkhabad: Academy of Sciences of the Turkmenian SSR.
- VICH, M.A. (1990). The origins and growth of transpersonal psychology. *Journal of Humanistic Psychology*, 30(2), 47-50.
- ZINKOVSKY, V.V. (1989). *Istoriya rnskoifilosofli* [History of Russian philosophy], v. I, II. Paris: YMCA Press,

Requests for reprints to: V.V. Nalimov & I.A. Drogalina, Laboratory Bldg. A, Laboratory of System Ecology, Moscow State University, Moscow 119899, Russia.

View Transpersonal Studies Research Papers on Academia.edu for free. Transpersonal psychology is a Western psychology with philosophical roots in transcendentalism and perennialist traditions that may include theism and non-dualism. Officially established in 1968, transpersonal psychology has gone through a number of shifts, including the participatory turn in the early 2000s. The Association of Black Psychologists (ABPsi), also founded in 1968, has built a substantial body of research on a variety of African epistemology, cosmology, and philosophy to create the field of African-centered psychology.